The Implementation of Literature Teaching Approaches in the ESL Classroom: A Systematic Review

Farhanah Mohamad Fikray
School of Education, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, 81310 UTM Johor Bahru, Johor, Malaysia

Hadina Habil
Language Academy, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, 81310 UTM Johor Bahru, Johor, Malaysia


ABSTRACT

According to Widowson (1984), teachers are having dilemmas in choosing the right teaching method for the non-native learners. Thus, the methods to teaching literature are constantly changing to suit learners’ needs and differences (Padurean, 2015). This paper aims to highlight on two main objectives. Firstly, it aims to describe the literature teaching approaches applied by teachers in the ESL classroom. Secondly, it intends to elaborate on the challenges in applying appropriate literature teaching approaches in the lesson. This research employs thematic analysis of 22 journal articles related to the teaching and learning of literature in the ESL settings through the use of systematic review approach. Specific samples’ inclusion and exclusion criteria are applied during the screening process of article search and the main platform for sample collection are Scopus and Google Scholar. The distribution of year for the article sampling is set between the years of 2003 to 2021. Important keywords such as ESL teaching strategies, literature teaching approaches, challenges in teaching literature, ESL teaching and learning, and second language pedagogy were used to search for relevant samples. The findings show that there are six approaches to teaching literature that may be applied by the ESL teachers in their classroom, which are the information-based, paraphrastic, stylistic, language-based, reader response and moral philosophical approach. Meanwhile, previous research shows that the challenges to implement appropriate literature teaching approaches are the examination-oriented system, large class size, time constraint, learners’ attitude, poor language competence, and inappropriate texts selection.

Keywords: Teaching strategies, literature teaching approaches, challenges in teaching literature, ESL teaching and learning, second language pedagogy

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Literature has been integrated in the English language curriculum for secondary school learners since the year of 2000 until present. Throughout the years of its implementation, a lot of research have been conducted to raise issues related to the process of teaching and learning of this language aspect in the ESL classroom (Subramaniam, Shahizah Ismail Hamdan & Koo, 2003; Radzuwan Abdul Rashid, Vethamani, & Shireena Basree, 2010). With its aim to encourage language competency during the teaching and learning process, learners are prescribed with multiple genres of reading materials which are short stories, drama, graphic novels, poems, and novels as materials to enrich their reading skills. In addition, the incorporation of literature in the second language lessons may enhance and inculcate thinking skills among learners (KSSM, 2018).
Besides, the authenticity of literary texts allows readers to expand their vocabulary to be used in the real-life situations which encourage language improvements, and development of other language skills such as speaking, writing as well as listening (Kaowiwattanakul, 2021). Nevertheless, the incorporation of literature in the English language classroom is still a subject of debate among the policy makers, students, teachers, and parents (Radzuwan Abdul Rashid, Vethamani, & Shireena Basree, 2010). One of the reasons leading to this situation is because of the incompatible teachers’ approaches of teaching the literary texts with the present learners’ learning strategies. According to San Jose and Galang (2015), it is impossible to pick a single teaching approach to fit the needs of all types of students since learners constitute of different motivational dynamics in which they respond differently during the lesson. Thus, adopting a task-based method in the learning process might favour the active students and discourage those who are timid. This is because, Ellis (2003) states that, the task-based approach emphasizes on learners’ ability in using the language to deliver understandable messages through communication. Thus, learning the linguistic forms and principle is the secondary goal of the lesson. This circumstance shows that this approach is more practical to be applied to extrovert learners instead of the introvert ones. Thus, it proves that this approach somehow neglects learners’ need as each of them are unique to their own leaning styles and interests (Tonia Grace Ganta, 2015) Meanwhile, the traditional teacher centered learning may inspire certain group of learners but frustrate the other parties. For example, the traditional approach may attract students with auditory learning style, instead of those who prefer to learn through visual, read/write or kinesthetic method. Hence, this shows that teachers approach to teaching play vital roles in the lessons it affects learners’ understanding and academic performance (Yeung, Read, & Schmid, 2012). Thus, it is the teachers’ role and responsibility to create well-planned teaching approaches to cater the variation in learners’ learning preferences so that it may help them to grasp the learning content optimally (Vethamani, 2003). In addition, it is vital for teachers to reflect, adapt, and learn from their everyday teaching approaches to create an effective classroom teaching and learning experience. Indirectly, these statements agree with Mulligan (2011) who emphasizes that, flexibility, creativity as well as continuous adjustment and monitoring, are the key techniques towards effective teaching. Plus, a study conducted by Asikainen et al., (2014) shows that there are a lot of factors contributing to positive effects of implementing appropriate teaching approaches, i.e., students’ learning strategies, motivation and the way they process acquired information despite other important elements such as teaching equipment, skills, and strategies. Hence, it is significant to emphasize that the main issue to be highlighted in this paper is connected to the topic of ESL teachers’ approaches of teaching literature in the English language lessons. To further elaborate the research topic, this study is conducted based on these two research objectives:

1. To describe on the types of approaches that can be applied by the ESL teachers to teach literature texts in the lesson.
2. To describe the challenges that ESL teachers faced to implement the approaches of teaching literature in their classroom.

According to San Jose and Padurean (2015), ways of teaching literature are progressively developing over the years. Thus, implementing new teaching approaches in the classroom creates different responses from the students and it may also affect the success rate of the learning outcomes. Most of the time, new strategies come with several challenges in its execution. Due to this situation, teachers are considered as a dealer of multiple contradictory interests among the students in the classroom (Lambert, 1985). Nevertheless, the multiple perspectives in the use of classroom teaching approaches sometimes would also
cause misinformation among learners. This situation is caused by several factors, which are lack of reflection and transformation in teaching practices as well as learners’ incapability to understand and adapt with the approach applied by the teachers in the classroom. Differences in the teachers’ expectation towards the learning outcomes and learners’ context may lead to frustration during the teaching and learning process. This argument is consistent with Kirschner, Sweller and Clark (2006) who suggest that both experienced and novice teachers frequently apply the use of faintly guided strategies and unreliable intuitions based on their previous practices which are always less effective during the teaching and learning process. Therefore, it is significant that this study discusses on the issues pertaining the approaches to teach literature in second language context so that teachers are given more ideas on how to appropriately conduct literature lesson with approaches that may suit their learners’ needs. Hence, students will be more interested to read and understand the literary texts provided for them.

2.0 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Concerns regarding methodologies in teaching literature have been widely discussed by the researchers in the field, and due to this situation, many literature texts and teaching techniques have been incorporated in the lesson as it proves to aid students in developing their emotional as well as intellectual progress (Jafriyatur Rohaniyah, 2012). Therefore, this section will describe the foundation of literature teaching approaches that have been introduced by Carter and Long (1991). In particular, there are three main models of teaching literature which are (1) the language model (2) the cultural model and (3) the personal growth model.

2.1 The Language Model

This technique emphasizes on the linguistic perspectives of the reading materials. Basically, this approach is related to the learners’ progress of knowledge as they interact with the familiar vocabulary, grammar as well as the discourse of the texts (San Jose & Padurean, 2015). Plus, Aydin (2013) also adds that this approach allows learners to explore the functions of language through the literary texts. Furthermore, Mustakim, Mustapha and Lebar (2018) state that, this approach enables the teachers to apply multiple language teaching strategies to interpret literature reading materials with the aim to achieve certain language goals. In addition, this method will also help to improve learners’ competency and proficiency in language learning as literature texts act as a channel to enhance learners’ linguistics skills (Hwang & Embi, 2007). Furthermore, students also benefitted from this technique as they can acquire the aesthetic values of the text via the quality of communication and expression of the literature.

2.1.1 The Information-based Approach

According to Carter and Long (1991), this approach focuses on exposing the learners with information and knowledge about the target language. It is mainly a teacher-centred learning process where learners are actively receiving input directly from the teachers regarding the texts provided for them. Furthermore, teachers are expected to play active role as the main reference in the lesson. The information that was given to the students reflects the cultural, political as well as social background of the texts being studied.
2.2 The Cultural Model

Meanwhile, the cultural model of literature teaching approach highlights on using the texts as the main resource for information and facts. Specifically, this approach can be considered as a teacher centered method as teachers play the role of the main source of knowledge. Besides, San Jose & Galang (2015) states that, this approach is transdisciplinary as the focus are on the cultural and ideological knowledge of a country rather than a channel for language acquisition. In short, this strategy explores more on a nation’s identity rather than the structural features of language. Besides, Yimwilai (2015) suggested that learners are expected to analyse the text by looking at the history, political as well as its social context and characteristics. Meanwhile, Savvidou (2004), views the cultural model as a traditional method to teaching literature. Although it is said that this approach leads towards one way classroom interaction, the cultural model enables the learners to comprehend different cultural representation or ideologies within the text by relating it to their own perspectives. In one way or another, it can be said that this model may expand the universality of thoughts as well as ideas among the students.

2.2.1 The Paraphrastic Approach

According to Sii and Chen (2016), the paraphrastic approach is a method in which literary texts are explained or elaborated in simpler words by the teachers. This approach involves rewording, direct translating, or code-switching processes so that learners are able to grasp the content of the texts appropriately. As the same with the information-based approach, it is also a teacher centered teaching strategy as teachers must provide information or background input of the text to help learners in comprehending the literary reading materials provided for them. Thus, this approach is suitable for novice learners as it provides easier platform for them to generate assumptions or interpretation of the texts (Talif, 1995)

2.2.2 The Stylistic Approach

Specifically, this approach entails the analysis of language and linguistic as well as it involves literary critics (Sii & Chen, 2016) of the reading materials. According to Thunnithet (2011), learners are able to create knowledge and language awareness since this approach focuses on understanding the meaning and the analysis of elements in the texts.

2.2.3 The Language Based Approach

The language based approach is a student-centred learning strategy which exposes the learners with the elements of syntax, semantic, and phonology as it main aim is to create language awareness in the reading process (Ashairi Suliman, Melor Md Yunus and Mohamed Yusoff Mohd Nor, 2019). This means that, the literary texts functioned as mediums or materials of conducting activities rather than using it as sources of information. With reference to (Dhillon & Mogan, 2014), this approach aid in improving language performance among students as it implement the use of language and literature skills while reading.
2.3 The Personal Growth Model

The third one is the personal growth model. This approach bridges the use of language model and cultural model while teaching literature. Particularly, emphasis is given on the language use within a specific context of culture. By this way, learners are expected to engage with the text through their intellectual and emotional ability to understand messages as well as reading activities. Therefore, the students are allowed to use the language optimally in the process of comprehending the literary texts which will also lead to the development of other language skills such as writing, speaking and listening (Fisher, 2003). This model allows students to connect and respond towards the reading materials in relation with their own real-life experience. Hence, learners’ linguistic, emotion as well as character development can be encouraged (Hwang & Embi, 2007). Besides, this model of teaching literature educates learners to study the texts through its style and link between the language forms and content (Short, 1996).

2.3.1 The Personal Response Approach

The personal response approach motivates the students to try to relate their own real life experience with the themes of the texts being studied. This approach is the opposite of information based approach as it seeks to elicit the learners’ personal opinion and feedbacks about the reading material (Hwang & Embi, 2007). Indirectly, the use of this approach provide opportunities for learners to discuss on certain issues based on their own perspectives and it helps in engaging them with personal enjoyment and pleasure during the reading process (Divsar, 2014). At the same time, the language and literary competency can be developed among learners.

2.3.2 The Moral Philosophical Approach

As compared to the other literature teaching approaches that have been discussed earlier, this approach highlights on learners' awareness towards the philosophical and moral values of the texts during the reading process (Radzuwan Abdul Rashid., Vethamani & Shireena Basree. 2010). This means that, learners are required to interpret the meaning of the literary works beyond text level as they need to be able to make inferences on the moral as well as philosophical aspects of the reading materials. Besides, this approach will also help in instilling good values and self-realization among learners during the process of making sense of the texts (Lim & Omar, 2007). According to Sii and Chen (2016), this approach is parallel with the aim of the Ministry of education in the curriculum specification which is to inculcate good values and morality for better citizenships.

Particularly, the models and approaches of teaching literature that have been discussed explain different focus on how literary texts can be taught to the students. The first approach highlights on the structural as well as grammatical principle of the texts. The second one touches on the cultural elements of the literature. Finally, the third model integrates the analytical interpretation of both linguistic and cultural features of the reading materials as a strategy to help the students in comprehending the texts. Therefore, it is vital that teachers choose the appropriate method as a potential pedagogic tool to be applied in their classroom so that learners are able to benefit from the effective teaching and learning of literature successfully (Savvidou, 2004).
3.0 METHODOLOGY

With the aim to fulfill the research objectives, a systematic literature review approach was conducted on the related academic articles by following Chalkiadaki (2018) framework of research procedure. The framework determined the inclusion and exclusion criteria of the potential research articles to keep the focus of the study on track. In order to do this, the reading sources that will be reviewed are set into specific criteria as listed in Table 1. First of all, the search for articles is done through the use of two main academic databases which are Scopus and Google scholar. These academic online resources have been chosen as the primary reference for this study because of its reputation in providing numerous amounts of valid and reliable articles on the research topic.

Table 1 Inclusion and exclusion criteria of the article sources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of criterion</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Inclusion</th>
<th>Exclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic databases</td>
<td>Scopus and Google scholar</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keywords</td>
<td>Teaching strategies, literature teaching approaches, challenges in teaching literature, ESL teaching and learning, second language pedagogy</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication types</td>
<td>Journal articles</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conference papers</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reports</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dissertation</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Books</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>Online</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period of publication</td>
<td>2003-2020</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place of publication</td>
<td>Worldwide</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of study</td>
<td>Empirical investigation</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theoretical studies</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research design</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This study uses five main keywords for article search which are (i) Teaching strategies, (ii) literature teaching approaches, (iii) challenges in teaching literature, (iv) ESL teaching and learning, as well as (v) second language pedagogy. In the process of collecting and screening of the resources, a vast number of articles related to the topic have been gathered. However, only 22 of them were chosen as research samples since they provide relevant discussion on the theme of the current review appropriately. In addition, the types of articles that were analyzed in this research are empirical, conceptual and theoretical studies which revolve around the subject of the teaching and learning of literature in the ESL and EFL classroom. The selected article ranges from the year of 2003 to 2021. This timeline for research papers is selected because of several reasons. Firstly, studies in the early 2000 provide more understanding on how both teachers’ and learners’ respond to the literary texts prescribed by the Ministry of Education in its early introduction. Besides, many studies have also been conducted throughout the respective years which
elaborate in depth on the topic of literary teaching approaches such as Mustakim, Mustapha and Lebar (2014); Amer (2003); Savvidou (2004); Hwang and Embi (2007) and the list goes on. The prior research in the area helps to bridge the findings of the past and present studies. Besides, it enables the researcher to track the patterns and current trends in the field of the study.

4.0 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

4.1 The Approaches That Can Be Applied by ESL Teachers in Teaching Literature Texts

In this section, the researcher will address on the first research objective which is to explore on the approaches of teaching literature in the ESL classroom. In a study conducted by Ling and Chen (2016), it is demonstrated that Carter and Long (1991) models of teaching literature have been widely adapted and used as the main reference in language teaching. Since the models are among the first established models to teaching literature in the language classroom, it acts as the foundations to the latter literature teaching approaches (Hwang & Embi, 2007; Bagherkazemi & Alemi, 2010; Radzuwan Abdul Rashid, Vethamani, & Shireena Basree, 2010; Khatib, Rezaei & Derakhshan, 2011; Thunnithet, 2011; Nair et al., 2012; Aydin, 2013). The examples of new literature teaching approaches that have been derived from Carter and Long (1991) models of teaching literature are (i) the information-based approach, (ii) paraphrastic approach, (iii) stylistic approach, (iv) language-based approach, (v) Personal responses approach, and (vi) moral-philosophical approach. Firstly, focus will be given on the cultural model. According to Thunnithet (2011), there is a close relationship between this model with the information-based approach. Hwang and Embi (2007) propose that this approach view literature as the main facts and informational resource that must be presented by the teacher for the students. Indirectly, this strategy applies traditional teaching methods as it practices the teacher centered-learning atmosphere (Radzuwan Abdul Rashid, Vethamani, & Shireena Basree, 2010). Furthermore, Aydin (2013) suggests that this model emphasizes on the role of literature as the main source for ideas, knowledge, and values of a specific culture throughout certain historical periods. In a way, learners are expected to interpret and analyze a text by appreciating the ideologies in multicultural settings. Besides, this approach is also defined as a method which offers vast number of inputs and knowledge for the learners (Thunnithet, 2011). As a subordinate to the cultural model, teachers possess full control during lessons whereby students undergo the learning process through lectures, notes reading, elaboration as well as writing analytical criticism of texts provided from the textbook or tasks provided by the teacher (Carter & McRae, 1996). This situation agrees with Carter and Long (1991) who describe that the information-based approach is a way of teaching which emphasizes on the use of literature as the source of knowledge for the learners. It requires the students to observe the history as well as characteristic of the text in terms of its political, cultural, social, and historical perspectives (Lazar, 1993). In Malaysian context, a study conducted by Hwang and Embi (2007) shows that, ESL teachers have high tendency of applying the information-based approach when teaching literature component in the classroom. Activities such as explaining the content of the texts, asking students questions on their understanding about the reading materials, and explaining the gist and information of the texts to the students are some of the examples on how this type of approach is conducted during the lessons. It is important to note that this approach is applied in the classroom to examine whether learners remember and understand the literary texts, as well as to elicit learners’ feedback and responses about the texts. In short, this approach demands large information from the teacher while students are very dependent in receiving the content of the lesson.
The next strategy in Carter and Long (1991) models of teaching literature is the language model. Specifically, there are three methods underlying this approach namely (i) the paraphrastic approach, (ii) the stylistic approach and (iii) the language-based approach. According to Lazar (1993), this teaching model view literature as the main source that accommodates language practices through multiple language activities rather than solely utilizing it for the purpose of extracting facts and information. In a study conducted by Aydin (2013), it is said that this approach introduces the students with different language functions, for example, grammar and vocabulary with the use of literary texts. Besides, there are also many activities that may be conducted by the ESL teachers to exercise this model in their classroom such as role play, prediction, question-discussion, brainstorming, generating views and so on (Hirvela, 1996; Lazar, 1993; Rosli Talif, 1995). For instance, role playing introduces learners with the real situations of social activities (Xu, 2011). Therefore, they are expected to express their views of an assigned situation according to their roles. In doing so, they need to create dialogue lines and rehearse it with appropriate use of language. These activities help learners to grasp new vocabulary of the target language (Mohd Yusop et al., 2018) develop speaking and communication skills as well as familiarize learners with the language functions (Masnan & Mohd Radzi, 2015). Thus, it makes this strategy as a platform of introducing the linguistic features of a language for the ESL learners (Carter & McRae, 1996; Rosli Talif, 1995). Therefore, the language model is an integration of language and literature that aims on developing learners’ language competence during the learning session (Carter & McRae, 1996; Hwang & Embi, 2007). This approach specifically seeks to elicit learners’ responses to the text. Rosli Talif (1995) highlights that it motivates the students to read by establishing relationship between the texts’ theme and their life experiences. This process helps teachers to presume students’ level of knowledge regarding a particular subject (Lundahl, 1998). Therefore, it is imperative that teachers are aware of the characteristic of this model before applying it in their classroom. This is because, the approach requires effective teaching and learning communication quality to preserve the aesthetic aspect of the literature texts (Khatib, Rezaei & Derakhshan, 2011).

As previously mentioned, there are three approaches which are the subordinates to language model. First of all, the discussion will highlight on the paraphrastic approach. Specifically, teachers explain the literary texts mainly by paraphrasing or rewording the whole reading materials in order to simplify its content. Not only that, it is possible to translate the text to enable the learners to have better text comprehension (Hwang & Embi, 2007; Divsar, 2014; Ling and Chen, 2016). According to Rosli Talif (1995), this approach is appropriate for teachers whose learners are still in the beginners’ level, since it scaffolds their understanding to formulate assumptions from the reading content. Furthermore, a study conducted by Hwang and Embi (2007) in Malaysian context suggests that learners who have low competency in English language may be assisted through the use of this approach as the use of simpler description of a text as well as the intervention of mother tongue during the lesson decrease the level of anxiety among students. Secondly, the stylistic approach is defined as a combination of linguistic as well as literary critics which guide the students towards better understanding of the literary texts (Carter & Long, 1996). This approach emphasizes on the language features of the texts where it focuses on the functions of linguistic elements in delivering the message that authors are trying to convey to the readers (Aydin, 2013; Hwang & Embi, 2007). In addition, Lazar (1993), emphasizes that, this technique aims to allows learners to come out with meaningful interpretation of the reading materials, and encourage them to explore the text beyond its surface meaning. Thus, students are expected to scrutinize the reading materials in terms of its linguistic features (Carter & Long, 1996). In summary, this approach may be applied by the teachers in their classroom in order to aid the students towards meaningful analysis of texts and indirectly develop
their language input (Thunnithet, 2011). Next, the discussion is on the language-based approach. According to Choudhary (2016) this approach aims to create awareness on the language of literature, and it is applicable mainly for novice or beginners. Research conducted by Ling and Chen (2016), described this technique as a means of learning through literature reading. It is considered as a student-centered teaching approach as it is an activities-based technique. There are a lot of classroom activities related to this approach which are writing the continuation of a story, debates, expressing opinions, poetry recitals, or summarizing the content of a literary reading material Divsar (2014). Besides that, Choudhary (2016) also states that this approach maximizes the implementation of communicative language teaching (CLT) optimally as it promotes the development of language skills through discussion, interaction, cooperation and collaboration as well as collective learning. Indirectly, it will also increase learners’ language proficiency and develop their literature skills through independent learning. Through this approach, teachers are able to encourage more responses from the students since the classroom experience is more engaging (Aydin, 2013). This is due to the fact that, it motivates learners to independently deal and handle the texts to develop autonomy learning experience and elevates their enjoyment as well as interest in learning literature.

The personal growth model of teaching literature bridges the functions of both cultural and language model by looking at the use of language, and its position within a specific context of culture (Savvidou, 2004). This approach aids in the development of language, ideas as well as learners’ content and formal schemata through multiple themes and topics in the texts. Thus, it relates to Goodman (1970) theories of reading and reader-texts interaction. With reference to Hwang and Embi (2007), this model of teaching promotes learners’ language development, emotions and character by engaging themselves with the issues and themes of the texts. Besides, it is also useful in inculcating the joy of reading literary texts for personal development and to establish connection with their real-life environment (Aydin, 2013). This positive reader-text interaction may generate pieces of work through classroom activities where it involves the process of comparing and contrasting the roles and characteristics of the characters in the texts with learners’ own life (Molloy, 2003). Thus, they are exposed to more reflective and analytical procedure of reading and discussions. In particular, this model comprises of two main teaching methods which are the personal-Response Approach and Moral-Philosophical technique (Ling & Chen, 2016). The personal-response approach allows teachers to encourage the students to make connection and express their feelings on the themes of the texts with their personal experience (Radzuwan Abdul Rashid, Vethamani, & Shireena Basree, 2010). Besides, it encourages learners to read for pleasure and develop second language competency (Divsar, 2014). Nevertheless, this concept of reading habit does not fit well in the ESL settings where learners’ first language becomes the focal preference of reading materials (Zainal Abidin & Taufik Lock Kim Wai, 2020). Hence, teachers may help to encourage learners’ second language reading process through appropriate pedagogical techniques during the teaching and learning sessions. Hwang and Embi (2007) have suggested several learning activities related to this approach, for example, discussions, generating opinions, and brainstorming as options to implement this approach in the ESL classroom.

On the other hand, the Moral-Philosophical Approach stresses on using literature to instill moral values among students (Rosli Talif, 1995; Hwang & Embi, 2007). According to Radzuwan Abdul Rashid, Vethamani, and Shireena Basree, (2010), the values of morality and philosophy can be identified by the learners throughout the reading process. The awareness on the moral values can be implemented by the end of literature lesson as it gives time for learners to evaluate and search for the moral elements while reading through activities such as reflective sessions (Wang, 2003). Furthermore, learners’ evaluation on the reading materials would also help the teachers to ask for their feedbacks and reflection (Parwathy et
Besides, it helps the students to achieve self-realization and self-figuration while interpreting the literature reading materials (Lim & Omar, 2007). Nevertheless, this approach needs the students to critically comprehend the moral and philosophical inference (Divsar, 2014). This approach is also parallel with the learning outcomes of Malaysian Secondary English Language curriculum which is to instill patriotism and good values for the citizens (Ministry of Education of Malaysia, 2000).

### 4.2 The Challenges to Implement the Literature Teaching Approaches in the ESL Classroom

There are multiple teaching approaches that may promote successful comprehension and develop linguistic knowledge among learners (Arafah, 2019; Khan and Alasmari, 2018). Plus, according to Ur (1991), the diversity in literature teaching resources and methodologies help learners to develop interpersonal and inferential abilities which then enhance their cognitive and language skills (speaking, writing, and listening). However, these approaches may somehow restrict the ESL teachers to optimally implement potential literature teaching approaches in the lessons due to several challenges. The first challenge proposed by Ling and Chen (2016) is on the examination-oriented system. In a research conducted by Marzilah Abdul Aziz and Sharifah Nadia Syed Nasharudin (2010) and Nair et al. (2012), students mainly learn literature for the purpose of passing the English language test rather than appreciating the aesthetic aspect of the texts. The study is supported by Zubaidah Awang and Shaidatul Akma Adi Kasuma (2010) who suggest that readers do not possess any interest in reading for pleasure since they only aim to have good results. In Malaysian context, this situation defeats the main aim of Ministry of Education (2000), where incorporating literature in the language classroom is for learners to experience reading enjoyment. This situation forces teachers to practice the cultural model of teaching literature as it is compatible with the examination-oriented system. Thus, it restricts learners to be critical in applying the higher order thinking skills (HOTs) while reading (Divsar, 2014; Radzuwan Abdul Rashid, Vethamani, & Shireena Basree, 2010; Hwang & Embi, 2007). This statement is supported by Kirkpatrick and Zang (2011), who states that the examination-oriented system inhibits learners’ ability to learn effectively as well as it leads to anxiety, psychological burden, and suppressed their creativity in the classroom.

The second challenge is because of the large classroom size. The number of students in a lesson affects the way teachers opt for specific approach. Catering a large classroom size makes it difficult for the teachers to organize interactive teaching activities (Radzuwan Abdul Rashid, Vethamani, & Shireena Basree, 2010; Divsar, 2014). A study conducted by Yelkpieri et al., (2012), shows that big classroom size affects the quality of teaching as it limits the progress of activities and exercises during learning. Besides, it is also difficult for teachers to monitor the flow of the lesson as learners vary in terms of learning strategies and personality. This statement is supported by Ayeni and Olowe (2016) who find that, bigger class capacity is a challenging factor in the classroom of any setting since it affects classroom’s management and control. As a result, learners would be less attentive towards the provided texts. Besides, applying the personal growth model of teaching literature in a large-sized classroom may lead to teaching and learning frustration since teachers are unable to invigilate and pay attention for each of the learners (Ling and Chen, 2016). The next challenge that hinders the implementation of literature teaching approach in the classroom is the time constraint. In relation with the teaching and learning of literature in the ESL classroom, it can be said that, applying new teaching approach and activities require more time since both teachers and learners must do some preparation in order for the activities to be successful and enjoyable. For instance, role playing requires time for stage set up, prop placement and the actor must arrange their
The implementation of literature teaching approaches can be challenging for teachers to adopt appropriate teaching approaches in the classroom. According to Pelletier et al. (2002), teachers’ decision in picking specific approach of teaching depends on the time allocation for the lesson. This statement is supported by Ling and Chen (2016) who agree that limited time for language learning stops the ESL teachers to try out new teaching methodologies in the classroom. It is quite unfortunate towards students’ language development since sufficient learning time helps activate learners’ cognitive ability that enhance understanding of the learning contexts (Wang, 2011; Chichekian and Shore, 2016; Murphy et al., 2007; Newman et al., 2004).

Learners’ language competence and attitudes towards learning literature are also factors which may cause challenges for teachers to adopt appropriate teaching approach in the classroom. In certain circumstance, it may be very hard for the teachers to apply variation in their teaching technique due to learners’ lack of proficiency of the target language. According to Perfetti et al., (2005) as well as Perfetti and Stafura (2014), the process of reading is complex, and it requires the combination of linguistic and cognitive skills to achieve the state of comprehension. Therefore, most teachers choose to conduct the paraphrastic approach in the classroom so that the less proficient learners are able to grasp the content of texts successfully (Ling and Chen, 2016). In a research conducted by Isikli and Tarakcioglu (2017), it is stated that, learners’ proficiency level plays an important role in successful lesson. This is because, it helps the students to better comprehend the text so that they may give feedbacks on what they learnt from the reading materials. Therefore, teachers need to contextualize their teaching methods so that it is compatible with the students’ background (Subramaniam, Shahizah Ismail Hamdan & Koo, 2003). On the other hand, learners’ attitude during the lesson is another student’s related challenge which requires the ESL teachers to carefully plan their literature teaching approaches. According to Zubaidah Awang and Shaidatul Akma Adi Kasuma (2010), the lack of interest, makes it difficult for the teachers to apply learning activities. Furthermore, passive feedbacks from the students and their reluctance to participate during the learning process require teachers to carefully select the method that may accommodate the learners’ academic, psychological, and emotional context (Radzuwan Abdul Rashid, Vethamani, & Shireena Basree, 2010; Agee, 1998).

Finally, the selection of texts for learners’ reading materials can also be one of the challenging factors affecting the teachers’ ability to integrate the use of multiple literature teaching approaches in the classroom (Ghazali et al., 2009). In literature lesson, the subject of incompatible selection of texts with learners’ proficiency has always been debated as an issue leading to frustrations and demotivation in the teaching and learning of the language (Fecteau, 1999; Subramaniam, 2002; Arvidson & Blanco, 2004). Besides, linguistic complexity and unfamiliar context of the texts lead to unsuccessful reading comprehension among learners. According to Gwin (1990) the complexity of stylistic representation within the texts especially in poetry restricts students’ ability to comprehend beyond the text level. This situation agrees with a study by Baizura Hasni (2007) who find that challenging reading materials could be a factor of learners’ lacking in interest to engage with the prescribed texts. Besides, the unsuitable prescription of texts causes the students to have negative expectation while reading as they presumed that the materials are full of incomprehensible lexical items (Doris & Navinder, 2000). Furthermore, vocabulary and grammatical complexities in a text pose certain problem for the students to make inference and to interpret the contextual clues in the reading process (Davis et al., 1992; Kaur & Thiagararajah 1999). Besides that, the unfamiliar cultural convention in the learning resources might as well be one of the reasons causing the teachers to stick with their usual kind of teaching method (Subramaniam, Shahizah Ismail Hamdan & Koo 2003). According to Maley (1989a) contextual unfamiliarity in the cultural elements of the texts creates language barrier resulting in misunderstanding among learners. It
requires teachers to re-explain and rectify misconceptions faced by the students. Indirectly, teachers must adapt with the classroom position by switching multiple methods of literature teaching to accommodate learners’ needs and enhance their positive reading behavior. This condition proves that texts selection in the ESL classroom shapes learners’ attitude and teacher’s approaches in teaching since the choice of classroom resources naturally comes with implications as well as challenges (Subramaniam, Shahizah Ismail Hamdan & Koo, 2003). Thus, adapting the reading texts according to the learners’ context is necessary as it helps to activate the learners’ background knowledge to analyze messages that authors are trying to convey (Tomlinson, 2011). Although it is challenging to find the perfect approach of teaching literature in the classroom, the potential to incorporate suitable techniques may be accomplished by the teachers through texts contextualization in terms of the students’ intellectual, cultural, and emotional assumptions (Subramaniam, Shahizah Ismail Hamdan & Koo, 2003; Blocksidge, 2000).

5.0 CONCLUSIONS

In summary, the approaches to teaching literature can be conceptualized as a set of interrelated beliefs concerning the nature of language teaching and learning which determine the classroom techniques and activities that may be applied by the teachers while teaching (Midhin 2015; Anthony, 1963). Paulston and Bruder (1976) view an approach as the theoretical foundation grounded on a particular systematic methodology. The variability and uniqueness of learners’ attitude and learning styles makes it vital for teachers to have knowledge and understanding on the roles of teaching techniques for successful classroom atmosphere (Permauldin, 2017). This systematic review elaborates on the approaches that can be applied by the ESL teachers to teach literature in the ESL settings. Briefly, there are six approaches of teaching literary texts for second language learners which are the information based, paraphrastic, stylistic, language-based, personal response, as well as moral philosophical approach. All these teaching techniques are related to the models of teaching literature proposed by Carter and Long (1991). Besides, this research also highlights on the challenges of implementing literature teaching methodology in the second language lessons. The findings show that there are six factors which affect the successful implementation on literature teaching approaches in the ESL context i.e., examination-oriented system, large class size, time constraint, language competency, students’ attitude, and literary texts selection.

There are several pedagogical implications which might be useful for the development of ESL teachers’ professionalism acquired from this review. Firstly, providing trainings for teachers are significant as it gives exposure, knowledge as well as support system to increase their teaching confidence (Ling and Chen, 2016). Furthermore, teachers with sufficient pedagogical information influence the way the learners respond to the literary reading materials which may result in better learning accomplishment (Ghazali et al., 2009). Besides, it is also suggested that teachers carefully choose learning materials that suit the learners’ context as it activates students’ schemata and reading motivation (Zhen, 2012). This situation contributes to a well-developed language enrichment and content understanding among learners (Adhikari, 2019). According to Duff and Maley (1990), creating multiple language activities to teach literature would also help teachers to be more systematic in handling the way they adopt an approach during lessons. Hence, opportunities for better classroom participation can be encouraged. Specifically, each of the literature teaching models that have been discussed in this paper may be used by the ESL teachers to achieve certain lesson objectives during the teaching and learning process. For example, the language model is best to be used by the teachers to introduce on how the language is used in the literature
texts. Basically, the main focus of the model is on gathering information on the content of the reading materials and it highlights learners’ knowledge development by asking them to work with specific grammar or lexical categories. However, this approach gives less emphasis on encouraging creative thinking among learners. On the other hand, the cultural model is best to be used as an approach to expose learners to the knowledge of the world as the main aim focuses on knowing a country’s ideologies, culture, social and political perspectives. Thus, it is appropriate to use this approach on more advance learners since good mastery in language is vital for learners to interpret texts through this model. Meanwhile, the personal growth model bridges the language and cultural model with the focus of using the language in a particular cultural context. In implementing this model, teachers are required to encouraged students to express feelings and opinion about the texts by relating it to their real life situation. In a way, it helps them to use critical thinking in comprehending the literary texts. The personal growth model is also closely related with the integrated model of teaching literature (Savvidou, 2004) as it merges the language and cultural perspective of texts interpretation. It helps learners to generate ideas on the linguistic and semantic aspects of the texts through written or spoken form during the reading process (Adhikari, 2019). In short, teaching strategies are fundamental in the context of language learning since it acts as a platform for the learners to grasp knowledge from the learning content (Galang, San Jose, 2015). This systematic review is not without limitation as it reviews only 21 journal articles collected from various sources of online academic databases. As the article samples ranges from the year of 2003-2021, the study may not cover certain theories and findings from research excluded from the timeline. Lastly, the discussion in this research emphasizes on the ESL and Malaysian context. Therefore, they might not be applicable to represent the whole population of English language learning. Nevertheless, it is hoped that the result from this study can be beneficial for teachers and learners in the respective field.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere appreciation and gratitude to my supervisor, Associate Professor Dr. Hadina Habil for the advice and guidance throughout the process of writing this paper. Also, thank you to my parents and family for their prayers and understanding.

REFERENCES

Amer, A. A. 2003. Teaching EFL/ESL literature. The Reading Matrix. 3(2).


Jaftiyatur Rohaniyah. 2012. Technique in Teaching Literature. OKARA: Jurnal Bahasa dan Sastra. 6(1).


Midhin, M. M. 2015. Techniques Used by University Instructors in Teaching Short Story. *International


